

Proof of the Schorr-Waite algorithm

Farhad Mehta and Tobias Nipkow

theory *SchorrWaite = Pointers:*

1 Machinery for the Schorr-Waite proof

constdefs

— Relations induced by a mapping

$rel :: ('a \Rightarrow 'a\ ref) \Rightarrow ('a \times 'a)\ set$

$rel\ m == \{(x,y). m\ x = Ref\ y\}$

$relS :: ('a \Rightarrow 'a\ ref)\ set \Rightarrow ('a \times 'a)\ set$

$relS\ M == (\bigcup m \in M. rel\ m)$

$addrs :: 'a\ ref\ set \Rightarrow 'a\ set$

$addrs\ P == \{a. Ref\ a \in P\}$

$reachable :: ('a \times 'a)\ set \Rightarrow 'a\ ref\ set \Rightarrow 'a\ set$

$reachable\ r\ P == (r^* \text{ `` } addrs\ P)$

lemmas $rel-defs = relS-def\ rel-def$

— Rewrite rules for relations induced by a mapping

lemma $self-reachable: b \in B \Longrightarrow b \in R^* \text{ `` } B$

apply *blast*

done

lemma $oneStep-reachable: b \in R \text{ `` } B \Longrightarrow b \in R^* \text{ `` } B$

apply *blast*

done

lemma $still-reachable: \llbracket B \subseteq Ra^* \text{ `` } A; \forall (x,y) \in Rb-Ra. y \in (Ra^* \text{ `` } A) \rrbracket \Longrightarrow Rb^* \text{ `` } B \subseteq Ra^* \text{ `` } A$

$B \subseteq Ra^* \text{ `` } A$

apply (*clarsimp simp only: Image-iff intro: subsetI*)

apply (*erule rtrancl-induct*)

apply *blast*

apply (*subgoal-tac (y, z) \in Ra \cup (Rb - Ra)*)

apply (*erule UnE*)

apply (*auto intro: rtrancl-into-rtrancl*)

apply *blast*

done

lemma $still-reachable-eq: \llbracket A \subseteq Rb^* \text{ `` } B; B \subseteq Ra^* \text{ `` } A; \forall (x,y) \in Ra-Rb. y \in (Rb^* \text{ `` } B) \rrbracket$

$\forall (x,y) \in Rb - Ra. y \in (Ra^* \text{ `` } A) \implies Ra^* \text{ `` } A = Rb^* \text{ `` } B$
apply (*rule equalityI*)
apply (*erule still-reachable ,assumption*)
done

lemma *reachable-null*: $\text{reachable } mS \ \{Null\} = \{\}$
apply (*simp add: reachable-def addr-def*)
done

lemma *reachable-empty*: $\text{reachable } mS \ \{\} = \{\}$
apply (*simp add: reachable-def addr-def*)
done

lemma *reachable-union*: $(\text{reachable } mS \ aS \cup \text{reachable } mS \ bS) = \text{reachable } mS \ (aS \cup bS)$
apply (*simp add: reachable-def rel-defs addr-def*)
apply *blast*
done

lemma *reachable-union-sym*: $\text{reachable } r \ (\text{insert } a \ aS) = (r^* \ \text{ `` } \text{addr } \{a\}) \cup \text{reachable } r \ aS$
apply (*simp add: reachable-def rel-defs addr-def*)
apply *blast*
done

lemma *rel-upd1*: $(a,b) \notin \text{rel } (r(q:=t)) \implies (a,b) \in \text{rel } r \implies a=q$
apply (*rule classical*)
apply (*simp add: rel-defs fun-upd-apply*)
done

lemma *rel-upd2*: $(a,b) \notin \text{rel } r \implies (a,b) \in \text{rel } (r(q:=t)) \implies a=q$
apply (*rule classical*)
apply (*simp add: rel-defs fun-upd-apply*)
done

constdefs

— Restriction of a relation

$\text{restr} :: ('a \times 'a) \text{ set} \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow \text{bool}) \Rightarrow ('a \times 'a) \text{ set} \quad ((-/ | -) [50, 51] 50)$
 $\text{restr } r \ m == \{(x,y). (x,y) \in r \wedge \neg m \ x\}$

— Rewrite rules for the restriction of a relation

lemma *restr-identity*[*simp*]:
 $(\forall x. \neg m \ x) \implies (R | m) = R$
by (*auto simp add: restr-def*)

lemma *restr-rtrancl*[*simp*]: $\llbracket m \ l \rrbracket \implies (R | m)^* \ \text{ `` } \{l\} = \{l\}$
by (*auto simp add: restr-def elim: converse-rtranclE*)

lemma [simp]: $\llbracket m \ l \rrbracket \implies (l, x) \in (R \mid m)^* = (l=x)$
by (auto simp add:restr-def elim:converse-rtranclE)

lemma restr-upd: $((rel \ (r \ (q := t)))(m(q := True))) = ((rel \ (r))(m(q := True)))$

apply (auto simp:restr-def rel-def fun-upd-apply)
apply (rename-tac a b)
apply (case-tac a=q)
apply auto
done

lemma restr-un: $((r \cup s) \mid m) = (r \mid m) \cup (s \mid m)$
by (auto simp add:restr-def)

lemma rel-upd3: $(a, b) \notin (r \mid (m(q := t))) \implies (a, b) \in (r \mid m) \implies a = q$
apply (rule classical)
apply (simp add:restr-def fun-upd-apply)
done

constdefs

— A short form for the stack mapping function for List

$S :: ('a \Rightarrow bool) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a \text{ ref}) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a \text{ ref}) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a \text{ ref})$
 $S \ c \ l \ r == (\lambda x. \text{if } c \ x \ \text{then } r \ x \ \text{else } l \ x)$

— Rewrite rules for Lists using S as their mapping

lemma [rule-format,simp]:
 $\forall p. a \notin \text{set stack} \longrightarrow \text{List } (S \ c \ l \ r) \ p \ \text{stack} = \text{List } (S \ (c(a:=x)) \ (l(a:=y)) \ (r(a:=z))) \ p \ \text{stack}$
apply(induct-tac stack)
apply(simp add:fun-upd-apply S-def)+
done

lemma [rule-format,simp]:
 $\forall p. a \notin \text{set stack} \longrightarrow \text{List } (S \ c \ l \ (r(a:=z))) \ p \ \text{stack} = \text{List } (S \ c \ l \ r) \ p \ \text{stack}$
apply(induct-tac stack)
apply(simp add:fun-upd-apply S-def)+
done

lemma [rule-format,simp]:
 $\forall p. a \notin \text{set stack} \longrightarrow \text{List } (S \ c \ (l(a:=z)) \ r) \ p \ \text{stack} = \text{List } (S \ c \ l \ r) \ p \ \text{stack}$
apply(induct-tac stack)
apply(simp add:fun-upd-apply S-def)+
done

lemma [rule-format,simp]:
 $\forall p. a \notin \text{set stack} \longrightarrow \text{List } (S \ (c(a:=z)) \ l \ r) \ p \ \text{stack} = \text{List } (S \ c \ l \ r) \ p \ \text{stack}$
apply(induct-tac stack)
apply(simp add:fun-upd-apply S-def)+

done

consts

— Recursive definition of what it means for a the graph/stack structure to be reconstructible

$stkOk :: ('a \Rightarrow bool) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a\ ref) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a\ ref) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a\ ref) \Rightarrow ('a \Rightarrow 'a\ ref) \Rightarrow 'a\ ref \Rightarrow 'a\ list \Rightarrow bool$

primrec

$stkOk\ nil: stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ [] = True$

$stkOk\ cons: stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ (p\#\ stk) = (stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ p)\ (stk) \wedge$
 $iL\ p = (if\ c\ p\ then\ l\ p\ else\ t) \wedge$
 $iR\ p = (if\ c\ p\ then\ t\ else\ r\ p))$

— Rewrite rules for `stkOk`

lemma $[simp]: \bigwedge t. \llbracket x \notin set\ xs; Ref\ x \neq t \rrbracket \Longrightarrow$

$stkOk\ (c(x := f))\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ xs = stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ xs$

apply $(induct\ xs)$

apply $(auto\ simp: eq\ sym\ conv)$

done

lemma $[simp]: \bigwedge t. \llbracket x \notin set\ xs; Ref\ x \neq t \rrbracket \Longrightarrow$

$stkOk\ c\ (l(x := g))\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ xs = stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ xs$

apply $(induct\ xs)$

apply $(auto\ simp: eq\ sym\ conv)$

done

lemma $[simp]: \bigwedge t. \llbracket x \notin set\ xs; Ref\ x \neq t \rrbracket \Longrightarrow$

$stkOk\ c\ l\ (r(x := g))\ iL\ iR\ t\ xs = stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ xs$

apply $(induct\ xs)$

apply $(auto\ simp: eq\ sym\ conv)$

done

lemma $stkOk\ r\ rewrite\ [simp]: \bigwedge x. x \notin set\ xs \Longrightarrow$

$stkOk\ c\ l\ (r(x := g))\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ x)\ xs = stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ x)\ xs$

apply $(induct\ xs)$

apply $(auto\ simp: eq\ sym\ conv)$

done

lemma $[simp]: \bigwedge x. x \notin set\ xs \Longrightarrow$

$stkOk\ c\ (l(x := g))\ r\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ x)\ xs = stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ x)\ xs$

apply $(induct\ xs)$

apply $(auto\ simp: eq\ sym\ conv)$

done

lemma $[simp]: \bigwedge x. x \notin set\ xs \Longrightarrow$

$stkOk\ (c(x := g))\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ x)\ xs = stkOk\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ (Ref\ x)\ xs$

apply $(induct\ xs)$

apply $(auto\ simp: eq\ sym\ conv)$

done

2 The Schorr-Waite algorithm

theorem *SchorrWaiteAlgorithm*:

VARs $c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p\ q\ root$

$\{R = \text{reachable}(\text{relS}\{l, r\})\ \{root\} \wedge (\forall x. \neg m\ x) \wedge iR = r \wedge iL = l\}$

$t := root; p := \text{Null};$

WHILE $p \neq \text{Null} \vee t \neq \text{Null} \wedge \neg t^{\wedge}.m$

INV $\{\exists\ \text{stack}.$

$\text{List}(S\ c\ l\ r)\ p\ \text{stack} \wedge$ --- (i1)

$(\forall x \in \text{set}\ \text{stack}. m\ x) \wedge$ --- (i2)

$R = \text{reachable}(\text{relS}\{l, r\})\ \{t, p\} \wedge$ --- (i3)

$(\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m\ x \longrightarrow$ --- (i4)

$x \in \text{reachable}(\text{relS}\{l, r\} | m)\ (\{t\} \cup \text{set}(\text{map}\ r\ \text{stack}))) \wedge$

$(\forall x. m\ x \longrightarrow x \in R) \wedge$ --- (i5)

$(\forall x. x \notin \text{set}\ \text{stack} \longrightarrow r\ x = iR\ x \wedge l\ x = iL\ x) \wedge$ --- (i6)

$(\text{stkOk}\ c\ l\ r\ iL\ iR\ t\ \text{stack})$ ---- (i7) }

DO IF $t = \text{Null} \vee t^{\wedge}.m$

THEN IF $p^{\wedge}.c$

THEN $q := t; t := p; p := p^{\wedge}.r; t^{\wedge}.r := q$ ---- pop

ELSE $q := t; t := p^{\wedge}.r; p^{\wedge}.r := p^{\wedge}.l;$ -- swing

$p^{\wedge}.l := q; p^{\wedge}.c := \text{True}$ FI

ELSE $q := p; p := t; t := t^{\wedge}.l; p^{\wedge}.l := q;$ -- push

$p^{\wedge}.m := \text{True}; p^{\wedge}.c := \text{False}$ FI OD

$\{(\forall x. (x \in R) = m\ x) \wedge (r = iR \wedge l = iL)\}$

(*is* *VARs* $c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p\ q\ root\ \{?Pre\ c\ m\ l\ r\ root\}\ (?c1; ?c2; ?c3)\ \{?Post\ c\ m\ l\ r\}$)

proof (*vcg*)

let *While* $\{(c, m, l, r, t, p, q, root). ?whileB\ m\ t\ p\}$

$\{(c, m, l, r, t, p, q, root). ?inv\ c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p\}\ ?body = ?c3$

{

— Precondition leads to Invariant:

fix $c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p\ q\ root$

assume $?Pre\ c\ m\ l\ r\ root$

thus $?inv\ c\ m\ l\ r\ root\ \text{Null}$ **by** (*auto simp add: reachable-def addr-def*)

next

— Postcondition follows from Invariant termination:

fix $c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p\ q$

let $\exists\ \text{stack}. ?Inv\ \text{stack} = ?inv\ c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p$

assume $a: ?inv\ c\ m\ l\ r\ t\ p \wedge \neg(p \neq \text{Null} \vee t \neq \text{Null} \wedge \neg t^{\wedge}.m)$

then obtain *stack* **where** *inv*: $?Inv\ \text{stack}$ **by** *blast*

from a **have** $p\ \text{Null}: p = \text{Null}$ **and** $t\ \text{Disj}: t = \text{Null} \vee (t \neq \text{Null} \wedge t^{\wedge}.m)$ **by** *auto*

let $?I1 \wedge - \wedge - \wedge ?I4 \wedge ?I5 \wedge ?I6 \wedge - = ?Inv\ \text{stack}$

from *inv* **have** $i1: ?I1$ **and** $i4: ?I4$ **and** $i5: ?I5$ **and** $i6: ?I6$ **by** *simp+*

from $p\ \text{Null}\ i1$ **have** *stackEmpty*: $\text{stack} = []$ **by** *simp*

from $t\ \text{Disj}\ i4$ **have** *RisMarked*[*rule-format*]: $\forall x. x \in R \longrightarrow m\ x$

```

  by(auto simp: reachable-def addr-def stackEmpty)
  from i5 i6 show  $(\forall x.(x \in R) = m x) \wedge r = iR \wedge l = iL$ 
  by(auto simp: stackEmpty expand-fun-eq intro:RisMarked)
next

```

```

— Invariant is preserved
fix c m l r t p q root
let  $\exists stack. ?Inv stack = ?inv c m l r t p$ 
let  $\exists stack. ?popInv stack = ?inv c m l (r(p \rightarrow t)) p (p \hat{.} r)$ 
let  $\exists stack. ?swInv stack =$ 
   $?inv (c(p \rightarrow True)) m (l(p \rightarrow t)) (r(p \rightarrow p \hat{.} l)) (p \hat{.} r) p$ 
let  $\exists stack. ?puInv stack =$ 
   $?inv (c(t \rightarrow False)) (m(t \rightarrow True)) (l(t \rightarrow p)) r (t \hat{.} l) t$ 
let  $?ifB1 = (t = Null \vee t \hat{.} m)$ 
let  $?ifB2 = p \hat{.} c$ 

```

```

assume  $(\exists stack. ?Inv stack) \wedge (p \neq Null \vee t \neq Null \wedge \neg t \hat{.} m)$  (is -  $\wedge ?whileB$ )
then obtain stack where inv:  $?Inv stack$  and whileB:  $?whileB$  by blast
let  $?I1 \wedge ?I2 \wedge ?I3 \wedge ?I4 \wedge ?I5 \wedge ?I6 \wedge ?I7 = ?Inv stack$ 
from inv have i1:  $?I1$  and i2:  $?I2$  and i3:  $?I3$  and i4:  $?I4$ 
  and i5:  $?I5$  and i6:  $?I6$  and i7:  $?I7$  by simp+
have stackDist: distinct (stack) using i1 by (rule List-distinct)

```

```

show  $(?ifB1 \longrightarrow (?ifB2 \longrightarrow (\exists stack. ?popInv stack))) \wedge$ 
 $(\neg ?ifB2 \longrightarrow (\exists stack. ?swInv stack)) \wedge$ 
 $(\neg ?ifB1 \longrightarrow (\exists stack. ?puInv stack))$ 

```

proof –

```

{
  assume ifB1:  $t = Null \vee t \hat{.} m$  and ifB2:  $p \hat{.} c$ 
  from ifB1 whileB have pNotNull:  $p \neq Null$  by auto
  then obtain addr-p where addr-p-eq:  $p = Ref\ addr-p$  by auto
  with i1 obtain stack-tl where stack-eq:  $stack = (addr\ p) \# stack-tl$ 
  by auto
  with i2 have m-addr-p:  $p \hat{.} m$  by auto
  have stackDist: distinct (stack) using i1 by (rule List-distinct)
  from stack-eq stackDist have p-notin-stack-tl:  $addr\ p \notin set\ stack-tl$  by simp
  let  $?poI1 \wedge ?poI2 \wedge ?poI3 \wedge ?poI4 \wedge ?poI5 \wedge ?poI6 \wedge ?poI7 = ?popInv\ stack-tl$ 
  have ?popInv stack-tl
  proof –

```

— List property is maintained:

```

from i1 p-notin-stack-tl ifB2
have poI1:  $List\ (S\ c\ l\ (r(p \rightarrow t)))\ (p \hat{.} r)\ stack-tl$ 
  by(simp add: addr-p-eq stack-eq, simp add: S-def)

```

moreover

— Everything on the stack is marked:

```

from i2 have poI2:  $\forall x \in set\ stack-tl. m\ x$  by (simp add: stack-eq)
moreover

```

— Everything is still reachable:

```

let ( $R = \text{reachable } ?Ra \ ?A$ ) = ?I3
let ?Rb = (relS {l, r(p → t)})
let ?B = {p, p^.r}
— Our goal is  $R = \text{reachable } ?Rb \ ?B$ .
have ?Ra* “  $\text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ “ addrs } ?B$  (is ?L = ?R)
proof
  show ?L  $\subseteq$  ?R
  proof (rule still-reachable)
    show  $\text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ “ addrs } ?B$ 
    by (fastsimp simp:addrs-def relS-def rel-def addr-p-eq
      intro:oneStep-reachable Image-iff[THEN iffD2])
    show  $\forall (x,y) \in ?Ra - ?Rb. y \in (?Rb^* \text{ “ addrs } ?B)$ 
    by (clarsimp simp:relS-def)
      (fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def dest:rel-upd1)
  qed
show ?R  $\subseteq$  ?L
proof (rule still-reachable)
  show  $\text{addrs } ?B \subseteq ?Ra^* \text{ “ addrs } ?A$ 
  by (fastsimp simp:addrs-def rel-defs addr-p-eq
    intro:oneStep-reachable Image-iff[THEN iffD2])
  next
  show  $\forall (x, y) \in ?Rb - ?Ra. y \in (?Ra^* \text{ “ addrs } ?A)$ 
  by (clarsimp simp:relS-def)
    (fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def dest:rel-upd2)
  qed
qed
with i3 have poI3:  $R = \text{reachable } ?Rb \ ?B$  by (simp add:reachable-def)
moreover

```

— If it is reachable and not marked, it is still reachable using...

```

let  $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m \ x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Ra \ ?A = ?I4$ 
let ?Rb = relS {l, r(p → t)} | m
let ?B = {p}  $\cup$  set (map (r(p → t)) stack-tl)
— Our goal is  $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m \ x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb \ ?B$ .
let ?T = {t, p^.r}

```

```

have ?Ra* “  $\text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ “ (addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T)$ 
proof (rule still-reachable)
  have rewrite:  $\forall s \in \text{set } \text{stack-tl}. (r(p \rightarrow t)) \ s = r \ s$ 
  by (auto simp add:p-notin-stack-tl intro:fun-upd-other)
  show  $\text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ “ (addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T)$ 
  by (fastsimp cong:map-cong
    simp:stack-eq addrs-def rewrite intro:self-reachable)
  show  $\forall (x, y) \in ?Ra - ?Rb. y \in (?Rb^* \text{ “ (addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T))$ 
  by (clarsimp simp:restr-def relS-def)
    (fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def dest:rel-upd1)
qed

```

— Bring a term from the right to the left of the subset relation.

hence *subset*: $?Ra^* \text{ “ } \text{“} \text{ } ?A - ?Rb^* \text{ “ } \text{“} \text{ } ?T \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ “ } \text{“} \text{ } ?B$

by *blast*

have *poI4*: $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb \ ?B$

proof (*rule allI, rule impI*)

fix *x*

assume *a*: $x \in R \wedge \neg m x$

— First, a disjunction on $p \hat{.} r$ used later in the proof

have *pDisj*: $p \hat{.} r = \text{Null} \vee (p \hat{.} r \neq \text{Null} \wedge p \hat{.} r \hat{.} m)$ **using** *poI1 poI2*

by *auto*

— *x* belongs to the left hand side of *subset*:

have *incl*: $x \in ?Ra^* \text{ “ } \text{“} \text{ } ?A$ **using** *a i4*

by (*simp only: reachable-def, clarsimp*)

have *excl*: $x \notin ?Rb^* \text{ “ } \text{“} \text{ } ?T$ **using** *pDisj ifB1 a*

by (*auto simp add: addrs-def*)

— And therefore also belongs to the right hand side of *subset*,

— which corresponds to our goal.

from *incl excl subset* **show** $x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb \ ?B$

by (*auto simp add: reachable-def*)

qed

moreover

— If it is marked, then it is reachable

from *i5* **have** *poI5*: $\forall x. m x \longrightarrow x \in R .$

moreover

— If it is not on the stack, then its *l* and *r* fields are unchanged

from *i7 i6 ifB2*

have *poI6*: $\forall x. x \notin \text{set stack-tl} \longrightarrow (r(p \rightarrow t)) x = iR x \wedge l x = iL x$

by (*auto simp: addr-p-eq stack-eq fun-upd-apply*)

moreover

— If it is on the stack, then its *l* and *r* fields can be reconstructed

from *p-notin-stack-tl i7* **have** *poI7*: $\text{stkOk } c \ l \ (r(p \rightarrow t)) \ iL \ iR \ p \ \text{stack-tl}$

by (*clarsimp simp: stack-eq addr-p-eq*)

ultimately show *?popInv stack-tl* **by** *simp*

qed

hence $\exists \text{stack}. \ ?popInv \ \text{stack} \ ..$

}

moreover

— Proofs of the Swing and Push arm follow.

— Since they are in principle similar to the Pop arm proof,

— we show fewer comments and use frequent pattern matching.

{

— Swing arm

assume *ifB1*: *?ifB1* **and** *nifB2*: $\neg ?ifB2$

from *ifB1 whileB* **have** *pNotNull: p ≠ Null* **by** *clarsimp*
then obtain *addr-p* **where** *addr-p-eq: p = Ref addr-p* **by** *clarsimp*
with *i1* **obtain** *stack-tl* **where** *stack-eq: stack = (addr p) # stack-tl*
by *clarsimp*
with *i2* **have** *m-addr-p: p ^ .m* **by** *clarsimp*
from *stack-eq stackDist* **have** *p-notin-stack-tl: (addr p) ∉ set stack-tl*
by *simp*
let *?swI1 ∧ ?swI2 ∧ ?swI3 ∧ ?swI4 ∧ ?swI5 ∧ ?swI6 ∧ ?swI7 = ?swInv stack*
have *?swInv stack*
proof –

— List property is maintained:

from *i1 p-notin-stack-tl nifB2*
have *swI1: ?swI1*
by (*simp add:addr-p-eq stack-eq, simp add:S-def*)
moreover

— Everything on the stack is marked:

from *i2*
have *swI2: ?swI2* .
moreover

— Everything is still reachable:

let *R = reachable ?Ra ?A = ?I3*
let *R = reachable ?Rb ?B = ?swI3*
have *?Ra* “ addrs ?A = ?Rb* “ addrs ?B*
proof (*rule still-reachable-eq*)
show *addrs ?A ⊆ ?Rb* “ addrs ?B*
by(*fastsimp simp:addrs-def rel-defs addr-p-eq*
intro:oneStep-reachable Image-iff[THEN iffD2])
next
show *addrs ?B ⊆ ?Ra* “ addrs ?A*
by(*fastsimp simp:addrs-def rel-defs addr-p-eq*
intro:oneStep-reachable Image-iff[THEN iffD2])
next
show $\forall (x, y) \in ?Ra - ?Rb. y \in (?Rb^* \text{“} \text{addrs } ?B)$
by (*clarsimp simp:relS-def*)
(*fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def fun-upd-apply dest:rel-upd1*)
next
show $\forall (x, y) \in ?Rb - ?Ra. y \in (?Ra^* \text{“} \text{addrs } ?A)$
by (*clarsimp simp:relS-def*)
(*fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def fun-upd-apply dest:rel-upd2*)
qed
with *i3*
have *swI3: ?swI3* **by** (*simp add:reachable-def*)
moreover

— If it is reachable and not marked, it is still reachable using...

let $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Ra ?A = ?I4$

let $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m\ x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb\ ?B = ?swI4$
let $?T = \{t\}$
have $?Ra^{*}\text{“} \text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^{*}\text{“}(\text{addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T)$
proof (*rule still-reachable*)
 have *rewrite*: $(\forall s \in \text{set } \text{stack-tl}. (r(\text{addr } p := l(\text{addr } p)))\ s = r\ s)$
 by (*auto simp add:p-notin-stack-tl intro:fun-upd-other*)
 show $\text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^{*}\text{“} \text{“} (\text{addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T)$
 by (*fastsimp cong:map-cong simp:stack-eq addrs-def rewrite*
 intro:self-reachable)
next
 show $\forall (x, y) \in ?Ra - ?Rb. y \in (?Rb^{*}\text{“}(\text{addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T))$
 by (*clarsimp simp:relS-def restr-def*)
 (*fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def fun-upd-apply*
 dest:rel-upd1)
qed
then have *subset*: $?Ra^{*}\text{“} \text{addrs } ?A - ?Rb^{*}\text{“} \text{addrs } ?T \subseteq ?Rb^{*}\text{“} \text{addrs } ?B$
 by *blast*
have $?swI4$
proof (*rule allI, rule impI*)
 fix x
 assume $a: x \in R \wedge \neg m\ x$
 with *i4* *addr-p-eq stack-eq* **have** *inc*: $x \in ?Ra^{*}\text{“} \text{addrs } ?A$
 by (*simp only:reachable-def,clarsimp*)
 with *ifB1* a
 have *exc*: $x \notin ?Rb^{*}\text{“} \text{addrs } ?T$
 by (*auto simp add:addrs-def*)
 from *inc exc subset* **show** $x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb\ ?B$
 by (*auto simp add:reachable-def*)
qed
moreover

— If it is marked, then it is reachable

from *i5*
have $?swI5$.
moreover

— If it is not on the stack, then its *l* and *r* fields are unchanged

from *i6 stack-eq*
have $?swI6$
 by *clarsimp*
moreover

— If it is on the stack, then its *l* and *r* fields can be reconstructed

from *stackDist i7 nifB2*
have $?swI7$
 by (*clarsimp simp:addr-p-eq stack-eq*)

ultimately show *thesis* **by** *auto*
qed

```

    then have  $\exists$  stack. ?swInv stack by blast
  }
moreover

{
  — Push arm
  assume nifB1:  $\neg$ ?ifB1
  from nifB1 whileB have tNotNull:  $t \neq \text{Null}$  by clarsimp
  then obtain addr-t where addr-t-eq:  $t = \text{Ref } \text{addr-t}$  by clarsimp
  with i1 obtain new-stack
    where new-stack-eq:  $\text{new-stack} = (\text{addr } t) \# \text{stack}$ 
    by clarsimp
  from tNotNull nifB1 have n-m-addr-t:  $\neg (t \hat{.} m)$  by clarsimp
  with i2 have t-notin-stack:  $(\text{addr } t) \notin \text{set stack}$  by blast
  let ?puI1  $\wedge$  ?puI2  $\wedge$  ?puI3  $\wedge$  ?puI4  $\wedge$  ?puI5  $\wedge$  ?puI6  $\wedge$  ?puI7 = ?puInv new-stack
  have ?puInv new-stack
  proof —

    — List property is maintained:
    from i1 t-notin-stack
    have puI1: ?puI1
      by (simp add:addr-t-eq new-stack-eq, simp add:S-def)
    moreover

    — Everything on the stack is marked:
    from i2
    have puI2: ?puI2
      by (simp add:new-stack-eq fun-upd-apply)
    moreover

    — Everything is still reachable:
    let R = reachable ?Ra ?A = ?I3
    let R = reachable ?Rb ?B = ?puI3
    have ?Ra* “addrs ?A = ?Rb* “addrs ?B
    proof (rule still-reachable-eq)
      show addrs ?A  $\subseteq$  ?Rb* “addrs ?B
        by (fastsimp simp:addrs-def rel-defs addr-t-eq
            intro:oneStep-reachable Image-iff[THEN iffD2])
      next
      show addrs ?B  $\subseteq$  ?Ra* “addrs ?A
        by (fastsimp simp:addrs-def rel-defs addr-t-eq
            intro:oneStep-reachable Image-iff[THEN iffD2])
      next
      show  $\forall (x, y) \in ?Ra - ?Rb. y \in (?Rb^* \text{“} \textit{addrs } ?B)$ 
        by (clarsimp simp:relS-def)
        (fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def dest:rel-upd1)
      next
      show  $\forall (x, y) \in ?Rb - ?Ra. y \in (?Ra^* \text{“} \textit{addrs } ?A)$ 
        by (clarsimp simp:relS-def)

```

(fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff addrs-def fun-upd-apply
dest:rel-upd2)

qed
with *i3*
have *puI3*: ?*puI3* **by** (simp add:reachable-def)
moreover

— If it is reachable and not marked, it is still reachable using...

let $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg m\ x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Ra\ ?A = ?I4$
let $\forall x. x \in R \wedge \neg ?new\text{-}m\ x \longrightarrow x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb\ ?B = ?puI4$
let $?T = \{t\}$
have $?Ra^* \text{ `` } \text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ `` } (\text{addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T)$
proof (rule still-reachable)
 show $\text{addrs } ?A \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ `` } (\text{addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T)$
 by (fastsimp simp:new-stack-eq addrs-def intro:self-reachable)
next
 show $\forall (x, y) \in ?Ra - ?Rb. y \in (?Rb^* \text{ `` } (\text{addrs } ?B \cup \text{addrs } ?T))$
 by (clarsimp simp:relS-def new-stack-eq restr-un restr-upd)
 (fastsimp simp add:rel-def Image-iff restr-def addrs-def
 fun-upd-apply addr-t-eq dest:rel-upd3)
qed
then have *subset*: $?Ra^* \text{ `` } \text{addrs } ?A - ?Rb^* \text{ `` } \text{addrs } ?T \subseteq ?Rb^* \text{ `` } \text{addrs } ?B$
 by blast
have ?*puI4*
proof (rule allI, rule impI)
 fix *x*
 assume *a*: $x \in R \wedge \neg ?new\text{-}m\ x$
 have *xDisj*: $x = (\text{addr } t) \vee x \neq (\text{addr } t)$ **by** simp
 with *i4 a* **have** *inc*: $x \in ?Ra^* \text{ `` } \text{addrs } ?A$
 by (fastsimp simp:addr-t-eq addrs-def reachable-def
 intro:self-reachable)
 have *exc*: $x \notin ?Rb^* \text{ `` } \text{addrs } ?T$
 using *xDisj a n-m-addr-t*
 by (clarsimp simp add:addrs-def addr-t-eq)
 from *inc exc subset* **show** $x \in \text{reachable } ?Rb\ ?B$
 by (auto simp add:reachable-def)
qed
moreover

— If it is marked, then it is reachable

from *i5*
have ?*puI5*
 by (auto simp:addrs-def *i3* reachable-def addr-t-eq fun-upd-apply
 intro:self-reachable)
moreover

— If it is not on the stack, then its *l* and *r* fields are unchanged

from *i6*
have ?*puI6*

```

    by (simp add:new-stack-eq)
  moreover

    — If it is on the stack, then its  $l$  and  $r$  fields can be reconstructed
  from stackDist i6 t-notin-stack i7
  have ?puI7 by (clarsimp simp:addr-t-eq new-stack-eq)

    ultimately show ?thesis by auto
  qed
  then have  $\exists$  stack. ?puInv stack by blast
}
ultimately show ?thesis by blast
qed
}
qed
end

```